

This miniproject asks you to find and explain the error in reasoning in three proofs. For two of them you will need the following information.

A *Pythagorean triple* is an ordered triple of integers  $(a, b, c)$  such that  $a^2 + b^2 = c^2$ . Note that if  $(a, b, c)$  is a Pythagorean triple, so is  $(b, a, c)$ . Similarly, a Pythagorean quadruple is an ordered four-tuple  $(a, b, c, d)$  such that  $a^2 + b^2 + c^2 = d^2$ . As an example, note that

$(3, 4, 5)$  is a Pythagorean triple since  $3^2 + 4^2 = 5^2$ ,

$(5, 12, 13)$  is a Pythagorean triple since  $5^2 + 12^2 = 13^2$ ,

and  $(3, 4, 12, 13)$  is a Pythagorean quadruple since  $13^2 = 5^2 + 12^2 = (3^2 + 4^2) + 12^2 = 3^2 + 4^2 + 12^2$ .

- (a) Explain why the argument given in #34 of Section 1.6 of the textbook does not work.  
 (b) Consider the following theorem and the two proofs given.

**Theorem** For every Pythagorean quadruple  $(a, b, c, d)$  there exists some order of the arguments  $a, b, c$  and an integer  $e$  such that  $(a, b, e)$  and  $(e, c, d)$  are both Pythagorean triples.

**Proof 1** Since  $(a, b, c, d)$  is a Pythagorean quadruple, we know that

$$a^2 + b^2 + c^2 = d^2.$$

But, by subtracting  $c^2$  for both sides, this tells us that

$$a^2 + b^2 = d^2 - c^2.$$

Therefore, let  $e^2 = d^2 - c^2$ . Then we have both of the following

$$a^2 + b^2 = e^2 \text{ (by definition of } e), \text{ and}$$

$$e^2 + c^2 = (d^2 - c^2) + c^2 = d^2,$$

which proves the theorem. □

**Proof 2** Since  $(a, b, c, d)$  is a Pythagorean quadruple, we know that

$$a^2 + b^2 + c^2 = d^2.$$

Assume that  $c$  is the largest of the three integers, so  $c \geq a$  and  $c \geq b$ , so that  $a^2 + b^2 = c^2$ . Then for  $e = c$  we have

$$a^2 + b^2 = c^2 = e^2$$

$$\text{and } e^2 + c^2 = a^2 + b^2 + c^2 = d^2,$$

which is what we wished to prove. □

Note that *neither* proof is correct. Do each of the following.

- (i) Find and explain the flaw of reasoning in the first proof.
- (ii) Find and explain the flaw of reasoning in the second proof.
- (iii) Is the theorem really a theorem? That is, is it correct? Explain.